

Nº 185

THE EX-ANTE NON-OPTIMALITY OF THE DEMPSTER-SCHAFER
UPDATING RULE FOR AMBIGUOUS BELIEFS

Sérgio Ribeiro da Costa Werlang
James Dow

Fevereiro de 1992

THE EX-ANTE NON-OPTIMALITY OF THE DEMPSTER-SCHAFER UPDATING RULE FOR AMBIGUOUS BELIEFS

James Dow
London Business School
Sussex Place, Regents Park,
London NW1 4SA, Great Britain.
FAX: (00 44 71) 724-3317

Sérgio Ribeiro da Costa Werlang
EPGE-Fundação Getúlio Vargas
Praia de Botafogo 190, 10^o andar,
22253, Rio de Janeiro, Brasil.
FAX: (00 55 21) 552-4898

ABSTRACT

The most widely used updating rule for non-additive probabilities is the Dempster-Schafer rule. Schmeidler and Gilboa have developed a model of decision making under uncertainty based on non-additive probabilities, and in their paper "Updating Ambiguous Beliefs" they justify the Dempster-Schafer rule based on a maximum likelihood procedure. This note shows in the context of Schmeidler-Gilboa preferences under uncertainty, that the Dempster-Schafer rule is in general not ex-ante optimal. This contrasts with Brown's result that Bayes' rule is ex-ante optimal for standard Savage preferences with additive probabilities.

1 INTRODUCTION

The standard representation in Economics of rational behavior under uncertainty is Savage's model. Savage's axiomatic derivation does not address the problem of how to update beliefs; nevertheless many considerations point to using Bayes' rule in his model. Brown(1976) showed that Bayes' rule is optimal in the sense that it maximizes ex-ante expected utility.

Schmeidler and Gilboa in a series of papers (Schmeidler(1982,1989), Gilboa(1987), Gilboa and Schmeidler(1989)) present a theory which is an alternative to Savage's theory of choice under uncertainty. In their theory of choice the individuals maximize the expected utility with respect to a non-additive probability, in the spirit of the belief function literature (Schafer(1976)). An application of this theory to portfolio selection may be found in Dow and Werlang(1992).

Again, the original axiomatic development of the model did not address the question of updating. The Dempster-Schäfer rule (DS for short) seems the natural candidate for the updating rule, although the situation is not as clear cut as in the case of Savage's model (see Wasserman and Kadane(1990)). Gilboa and Schmeidler(1992) give a justification of DS based on a maximum likelihood procedure. In this context it makes sense to ask whether DS is ex-ante optimal. In this note we give an example which shows that this is not the case.

2 EX-ANTE OPTIMALITY OF BAYES' RULE

Brown's result that Bayes' rule is ex-ante optimal may be expressed in formal terms as follows. Let Ω be the set of possible states of the world, assumed finite for simplicity, and let P be the subjective probability distribution defined on Ω . Assume $\Pi = \{A_1, A_2, \dots, A_n\}$ is a partition of Ω , with $P(A_i) > 0$ for all $i=1, \dots, n$. An updating rule is a function $Q: 2^\Omega \times \Pi \rightarrow [0,1]$, with the property that given $A \in \Pi$, $Q(\cdot, A)$ is a probability distribution with $Q(A, A) = 1$. We write $Q(\omega, A)$ for $Q(\{\omega\}, A)$ if $\omega \in \Omega$. The interpretation of $Q(E, A_i)$ is the probability of occurrence of the event E , given that the cell A_i of the partition Π has occurred. It should be clear that, in the way we defined Q , it also depends on the partition. Bayes' rule of updating is $Q(E, A) = B(E, A) = P(E \cap A)/P(A)$ for any event A with $P(A) > 0$, which is independent of the partition. An act is a function from the set of states Ω into the set of outcomes O . Let $u: O \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$ be the utility function. The ex-ante utility of an act α is $\sum_{\omega \in \Omega} P(\omega)u(\alpha(\omega))$. Given that the set A_i in the partition occurred, and the updating rule is Q , the ex-post utility is $\sum_{\omega \in A_i} Q(\omega, A_i)u(\alpha(\omega))$. Observe that it is irrelevant whether or not the sum is over A_i or over Ω , because, by definition, $Q(\omega, A_i) = 0$ if ω does not belong to A_i . Hence it makes sense to define the ex-ante utility of an act α given the updating rule is Q : $U(\alpha, Q) = \sum_{i=1, \dots, n} P(A_i)[\sum_{\omega \in A_i} Q(\omega, A_i)u(\alpha(\omega))]$. Assume that information is revealed prior to the choice of the act. Given that the set $A_i \in \Pi$ occurred, and that the updating rule Q is used, the individual chooses an act $\alpha_i(Q)$ which maximizes the ex-post expected utility i.e. $\sum_{\omega \in A_i} Q(\omega, A_i)u(\alpha_i(Q)(\omega)) \geq \sum_{\omega \in A_i} Q(\omega, A_i)u(\alpha(\omega))$, for all acts α (since it makes no difference whether or not acts are defined only on A_i , we assume they are defined only on A_i for ease of notation). The following result is easily proved (Brown(1976)):

Theorem Let $\alpha(Q) = (\alpha_1(Q), \alpha_2(Q), \dots, \alpha_n(Q))$ be the act defined as the combination of all ex-post optimal acts, given the updating rule Q . Then for any partition Π , it follows that Bayes' rule

(defined by \mathbf{B} above) is the updating rule which yields the maximum ex-ante expected utility, that is to say, $U(\alpha(\mathbf{B}), \mathbf{B}) \geq U(\alpha(\mathbf{Q}), \mathbf{Q})$ for any updating rule \mathbf{Q} .

3 AN EXAMPLE

The following example shows that this property does not hold for the Dempster-Schafer rule applied to the Schmeidler-Gilboa model.

Example Let $\Omega = \{1,2,3\}$, and $\Pi = \{\{1,2\}, \{3\}\}$. Let also the set of outcomes be \mathfrak{R} , and $u(x) = x$ for all $x \in \mathfrak{R}$. Assume the non-additive probability distribution P (which is also a belief function) is given by $P_1 = 0.1$, $P_2 = 0$, $P_3 = 0.05$, $P_{13} = 0.3$, $P_{23} = 0.65$, $P_{12} = 0.3$ ($P_{ij} = P(\{i,j\})$). Consider the act α given by $\alpha(1) = -2$, $\alpha(2) = 3$, $\alpha(3) = 1$ and the act β given by $\beta(1) = \beta(2) = 0$, $\beta(3) = 1$. By making use of the DS updating rule, we have $E_P[\alpha | \{1,2\}] = 22/19$ and $E_P[\alpha | \{3\}] = 1$. Clearly, $E_P[\beta | \{1,2\}] = 0$ and $E_P[\beta | \{3\}] = 1$. Thus, given the occurrence of any cell of the partition and the use of DS rule, act α is always weakly preferred to act β . In fact, in the set $\{1,2\}$ it is strictly preferred. Therefore, if we assume that the set of available acts is $\{\alpha, \beta\}$, it turns out that α is the combination of optimal ex-post choices given DS updating rule. However, ex-ante we have that $E[\alpha] = -0.05 < 0.05 = E[\beta]$, which means that act β is strictly preferred ex-ante to act α . Observe that the conditioning rule Q uniquely defined by the conditions: $Q(1, \{1,2\}) = Q(2, \{1,2\}) = 1/2$ and $Q(3, \{3\}) = 1$, gives act β as the combination of ex-post optimal acts (in the set $\{\alpha, \beta\}$). Hence, the updating rule Q yields higher ex-ante payoffs than DS rule. This shows that DS updating rule is not ex-ante optimal in general. The phenomenon of preference reversal with the partial revelation of information was noticed before in Dow, Madrigal and Werlang(1989), in an example similar to the one presented above.

Acknowledgements

This research was done when Dow was visiting the Graduate School of Economics of Getúlio Vargas Foundation (EPGE/FGV) under a grant of CNPq.

References

- Brown, P. 1976. Conditionalization and Expected Utility. *Philosophy of Science* 43:415-419.
- Dow, J., Madrigal, V. and Werlang, S. R. C. 1989. *Common Knowledge, Preferences and Speculative Trade*. Working Paper, London Business School and Getúlio Vargas Foundation.
- Dow, J. and Werlang, S. R. C. 1992. Uncertainty Aversion, Risk Aversion and the Optimal Choice of Portfolio. *Econometrica* forthcoming.
- Gilboa, I. 1987. Expected Utility with Purely Subjective Non-Additive Priors. *Journal of Mathematical Economics* 16:279-304.
- Gilboa, I. and Schmeidler, D. 1989. Maxmin Expected Utility with a Non-Unique Prior. *Journal of Mathematical Economics* 18:14-153.
- Gilboa, I. and Schmeidler, D. 1992. Updating Ambiguous Beliefs. In Y. Moses (ed.). *Theoretical Aspects of Reasoning About Knowledge: Proceedings of the Fourth Conference*. San Mateo, Calif.: Morgan Kaufman.
- Schmeidler, D. 1982. *Subjective Probability Without Additivity (Temporary Title)*. Working Paper, The Foerder Institute for Economic Research, Tel Aviv University.
- Schmeidler, D. 1989. Subjective Probability and Expected Utility Without Additivity. *Econometrica* 57:571-587.
- Shafer, G. 1976. *A Mathematical Theory of Evidence*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Wasserman, L. A. and Kadane, J. B. 1990. Bayes' Theorem for Choquet Capacities. *Annals of Statistics* 18:1328-1339.

ENSAIOS ECONOMICOS DA EPGE

100. JUROS, PRECOS E DIVIDA PUBLICA - VOL I: ASPECTOS TEORICOS
- Marco Antonio C. Martins e Clovis de Faro - 1987 (esgotado).
101. JUROS, PRECOS E DIVIDA PUBLICA - VOL II: A ECONOMIA BRASILEIRA -1971/85 - Antonio Salazar P. Brandao, Clovis de Faro e Marco A.C. Martins - 1987 (esgotado).
102. MACROECONOMIA KALECKIANA - Rubens Penha Cysne - 1987 (esgotado).
103. O PREMIO DO DOLAR NO MERCADO PARALELO, O SUBFATURAMENTO DE EXPORTACOES E O SUPERFATURAMENTO DE IMPORTACOES - Fernando de Holanda Barbosa, Rubens Penha Cysne e Marcos Costa Holanda-1987 (esgotado).
104. BRAZILIAN EXPERIENCE WITH EXTERNAL DEBT AND PROSPECTS FOR GROWTH - Fernando de Holanda Barbosa and Manuel Sanches de La Cal - 1987 (esgotado).
105. KEYNES NA SEDICAO DA ESCOLHA PUBLICA - Antonio Maria da Silveira - 1987 (esgotado).
106. O TEOREMA DE FROBENIUS-PERRON - Carlos Ivan Simonsen Leal - 1987. (esgotado)
107. POPULACAO BRASILEIRA - Jesse Montelo - 1987 (esgotado).
108. MACROECONOMIA - CAPITULO VI: "DEMANDA POR MOEDA E A CURVA LM" - Mario Henrique Simonsen e Rubens Penha Cysne - 1987 (esgotado).
109. MACROECONOMIA - CAPITULO VII: "DEMANDA AGREGADA E A CURVA IS" - Mario Henrique Simonsen e Rubens Penha Cysne - 1987 (esgotado).
110. MACROECONOMIA - MODELOS DE EQUILIBRIO AGREGATIVO A CURTO PRAZO - Mario Henrique Simonsen e Rubens Penha Cysne - 1987 (esgotado).
111. THE BAYESIAN FOUNDATIONS OF SOLUTIONS CONCEPTS OF GAMES - Sergio Ribeiro da Costa Werlang e Tommy Chin-Chiu Tan - 1987 (esgotado).
112. PRECOS LIQUIDOS (PRECOS DE VALOR ADICIONADO) E SEUS DETERMINANTES; DE PRODUTOS SELECIONADOS, NO PERIODO 1980/1. SEMESTRE/1986 - Raul Ekerman - 1987. (esgotado)
113. EMPRESTIMOS BANCARIOS E SALDO-MEDIO: O CASO DE PRESTACOES - Clovis de Faro - 1988 (esgotado).
114. A DINAMICA DA INFLACAO - Mario Henrique Simonsen - 1988 (esgotado).

115. UNCERTAINTY AVERSIONS AND THE OPTMAL CHOISE OF OPRTFOLIO - James Dow e Sergio Ribeiro da Costa Werlang - 1988 (esgotado)
116. O CICLO ECONOMICO - Mario Henrique Simonsen - 1988 (esgotado)
117. FOREIGN CAPITAL AND ECONOMIC GROWTH - THE BRASILIAN CASE STUDY - Mario Henrique Simonsen - 1988 (esgotado)
118. COMMON KNOWLEDGE - Sergio Ribeiro da Costa Werlang - 1988 (esgotado).
119. OS FUNDAMENTOS DA ANALISE MACROECONOMICA - Mario Henrique Simonsen e Rubens Penha Cysne - 1988 (esgotado).
120. CAPITULO XII - ESPECTATIVAS RACIONAIS - Mario Henrique Simonsen 1988 (esgotado).
121. A OFERTA AGREGADA E O MERCADO DE TRABALHO - Mario Henrique Simonsen e Rubens Penha Cysne - 1988 (esgotado).
122. INERCIA INFLACIONARIA E INFLACAO INERCIAL - Mario Henrique Simonsen - 1988 (esgotado).
123. MODELOS DO HOMEM: ECONOMIA E ADMINISTRACAO - Antonio Maria da Silveira - 1988. (esgotado)
124. UNDERINVOICING OF EXPORTS, OVERINVOINCING OF IMPORTS, AND THE DOLLAR PREMIUN ON THE BLACK MARKET - Fernando de Holanda Barbosa, Rubens Penha Cysne e Marcos Costa Holanda - 1988 (esgotado).
125. O REINO MAGICO DO CHOQUE HETERODOXO - Fernando de Holanda Barbosa, Antonio Salazar Pessoa Brandao e Clovis de Faro - 1988 (esgotado).
126. PLANO CRUZADO: CONCEPCAO E O ERRO DE POLITICA FISCAL - Rubens Penha Cysne - 1988. (esgotado)
127. TAXA DE JUROS FLUTUANTE VERSUS CORRECAO MONETARIA DAS PRESTACOES: UMA COMPARACAO NO CASO DO SAO E INFLACAO CONSTANTE - Clovis de Faro - 1988. (esgotado)
128. CAPITULO II - MONETARY CORRECTION AND REAL INTEREST ACCOUNTING - Rubens Penha Cysne - 1988. (esgotado)
129. CAPITULO III - INCOME ANDDEMAND POLICIES IN BRAZIL - Rubens Penha Cysne - 1988. (esgotado)
130. CAPITULO IV - BRAZILIAN ECONOMY IN THE EIGHTIES AND THE DEBT CRISIS - Rubens Penha Cysne - 1988.(esgotado)

131. THE BRAZILIAN AGRICULTURAL POLICY EXPERIENCE: RATIONALE AND FUTURE DIRECTIONS - Antonio Salazar Pessoa Brandao - 1988. (esgotado)
132. MORATORIA INTERNA, DIVIDA PUBLICA E JUROS REAIS - Maria Silvia Bastos Marques e Sergio Ribeiro da Costa Werlang - 1988. (esgotado)
133. CAPITULO IX - TEORIA DO CRESCIMENTO ECONOMICO - Mario Henrique Simonsen - 1988. (esgotado)
134. CONGELAMENTO COM ABONO SALARIAL GERANDO EXCESSO DE DEMANDA - Joaquim Vieira Ferreira Levy e Sergio Ribeiro da Costa Werlang - 1988. (esgotado)
135. AS ORIGENS E CONSEQUENCIAS DA INFLACAO NA AMERICA LATINA - Fernando de Holanda Barbosa - 1988. (esgotado)
136. A CONTA-CORRENTE DO GOVERNO -1970/1988 - Mario Henrique Simonsen - 1989. (esgotado)
137. A REVIEW ON THE THEORY OF COMMON KNOWLEDGE - Sergio Ribeiro da Costa Werlang - 1989. (esgotado)
138. MACROECONOMIA - Fernando de Holanda Barbosa - 1989 (esgotado)
139. TEORIA DO BALANCO DE PAGAMENTOS: UMA ABORDAGEM SIMPLIFICADA - Joao Luiz Tenreiro Barroso - 1989. (esgotado)
140. CONTABILIDADE COM JUROS REAIS - Rubens Penha Cysne - 1989. (esgotado)
141. CREDIT RATIONING AND THE PERMANENT INCOME HYPOTHESIS - Vicente Madrigal, Tommy Tan, Daniel Vicent, Sergio Ribeiro da Costa Werlang - 1989. (esgotado)
142. A AMAZONIA BRASILEIRA - Ney Coe de Oliveira - 1989. (esgotado)
143. DESAGIO DAS LFTs E A PROBABILIDADE IMPLICITA DE MORATORIA - Maria Silvia Bastos Marques e Sergio Ribeiro da Costa Werlang - 1989. (esgotado)
144. THE LDC DEBT PROBLEM: A GAME-THEORETICAL ANALYSIS - Mario Henrique Simonsen e Sergio Ribeiro da Costa Werlang - 1989. (esgotado)
145. ANALISE CONVEXA NO R^n - Mario Henrique Simonsen - 1989. (esgotado)
146. A CONTROVERSIA MONETARISTA NO HEMISFERIO NORTE - Fernando de Holanda Barbosa - 1989. (esgotado)

147. FISCAL REFORM AND STABILIZATION: THE BRAZILIAN EXPERIENCE
-Fernando de Holanda Barbosa, Antonio Salazar Pessoa Brandao e
Clovis de Faro - 1989.(esgotado)
148. RETORNOS EM EDUCACAO NO BRASIL: 1976/1986.
Carlos Ivan Simonsen Leal e Sergio Ribeiro da Costa Werlang -
1989.(esgotado)
149. PREFERENCES, COMMON KNOWLEDGE AND SPECULATIVE TRADE - James
Dow,Vicente Madrigal e Sergio Ribeiro da Costa Werlang
-1990.(esgotado)
150. EDUCACAO E DISTRIBUICAO DE RENDA - Carlos Ivan Simonsen Leal e
Sergio Ribeiro da Costa Werlang - 1990 (esgotado)
- 151 OBSERVACOES A MARGEM DO TRABALHO "A AMAZONIA BRASILEIRA" - Ney
Coe de Oliveira - 1990. (esgotado)
152. PLANO COLLOR: UM GOLPE DE MESTRE CONTRA A INFLACAO ? - Fernando
de Holanda Barbosa - 1990. (esgotado)
153. O EFEITO DA TAXA DE JUROS E DA INCERTEZA SOBRE A CURVA DE
PHILLIPS DA ECONOMIA BRASILEIRA - Ricardo de Oliveira
Cavalcanti - 1990 (esgotado)
154. PLANO COLLOR: CONTRA A FACTUALIDADE E SUGESTOES SOBRE A
CONDUCAO DA POLITICA MONETARIA-FISCAL - Rubens Penha Cysne -
1990. (esgotado)
155. DEPOSITOS DO TESOURO: NO BANCO CENTRAL OU NOS BANCOS
COMERCIAIS? - Rubens Penha Cysne - 1990 (esgotado)
156. SISTEMA FINANCEIRO DE HABITACAO: A QUESTAO DO DESEQUILIBRIO DO
FCVS - Clovis de Faro - 1990.(esgotado)
157. COMPLEMENTO DO FASCICULO Nº 151 DOS "ENSAIOS ECONOMICOS" (A
AMAZONIA BRASILEIRA) - Ney Coe de Oliveira - 1990.(esgotado)
158. POLITICA MONETARIA OTIMA NO COMBATE A INFLACAO - Fernando de
Holanda Barbosa - 1990.(esgotado)
159. TEORIA DOS JOGOS - CONCEITOS BASICOS - Mario Henrique Simonsen
- 1990. (esgotado)
160. O MERCADO ABERTO BRASILEIRO: ANALISE DOS PROCEDIMENTOS
OPERACIONAIS - Fernando de Holanda Barbosa - 1990.(esgotado)
161. A RELACAO ARBITRAGEM ENTRE A ORTN CAMBIAL E A ORTN MONETARIA. -
Luiz Guilherme Schymura de Oliveira - 1990.(esgotado)

162. SUBADDITIVE PROBABILITIES AND PORTFOLIO INERTIA - Mario Henrique Simonsen e Sergio Ribeiro da Costa Werlang - 1990.(esgotado)
163. MACROECONOMIA COM M4 - Carlos Ivan Simonsen Leal e Sergio Ribeiro da Costa Werlang - 1990.(esgotado)
164. A RE-EXAMINATION OF SOLOW'S GROWTH MODEL WITH APPLICATIONS TO CAPITAL MOVEMENTS - Neantro Saavedra Rivano - 1990.(esgotado)
165. THE PUBLIC CHOICE SEDITION: VARIATIONS ON THE THEME OF SCIENTIFIC WARFARE - Antonio Maria da Silveira - 1990.(esgotado)
166. THE PUBLIC CHOICE PERSPECTIVE AND KNIGHT'S INSTITUTIONALIST BENT - Antonio Maria da Silveira - 1990.(esgotado)
167. THE INDETERMINATION OF SENIOR - Antonio Maria da Silveira - 1990.(esgotado)
168. JAPANESE DIRECT INVESTMENT IN BRAZIL - Neantro Saavedra Rivano - 1990.(esgotado)
169. A CARTEIRA DE ACOES DA CORRETORA: UMA ANALISE ECONOMICA - Luiz Guilherme Schymura de Oliveira - 1991.
170. PLANO COLLOR: OS PRIMEIROS NOVE MESES - Clovis de Faro - 1991.
171. PERCALCOS DA INDEXACAO EX-ANTE - Clovis de Faro - 1991.
172. NOVE PONTOS SOBRE O PLANO COLLOR II - Rubens Penha Cysne - 1991.
173. A DINAMICA DA HIPERINFLACAO - Fernando de Holanda Barbosa, Waldyr Muniz Oliva e Elvia Mureb Sallum - 1991.(esgotado)
174. LOCAL CONCAVIFIABILITY OF PREFERENCES AND DETERMINACY OF EQUILIBRIUM - Mario Rui Pascoa e Sergio Ribeiro da Costa Werlang - maio de 1991.
175. A CONTABILIDADE DOS AGREGADOS MONETARIOS NO BRASIL - Carlos Ivan Simonsen Leal e Sergio Ribeiro da Costa Werlang - maio de 1991. (esgotado)
176. HOMOTHETIC PREFERENCES - James Dow e Sergio Ribeiro da Costa Werlang - 1991.
177. BARREIRAS A ENTRADA NAS INDUSTRIAS: O PAPEL DA FIRMA PIONEIRA - Luiz Guilherme Schymura de Oliveira - 1991.(esgotado)
178. POUPANCA E CRESCIMENTO ECONOMICO - - CASO BRASILEIRA - Mario Henrique Simonsen - agosto de 1991.
179. EXCESS VOLATILITY OF STOCK PRICES AND KNIGHTIAN UNCERTAINTY - James Dow e Sergio Ribeiro da Costa Werlang - 1991.

180. BRAZIL - CONDITIONS FOR RECOVERY - Mario Henrique Simonsen - 1991.
181. THE BRAZILIAN EXPERIENCE WITH ECONOMIC POLICY REFORMS .AND
- PROSPECTS FOR THE FUTURE - Fernando de Holanda Barbosa -
dezembro de 1991.
182. MACRODINAMICA: OS SISTEMAS DINAMICOS NA MACROECONOMIA -
Fernando de Holanda Barbosa - dezembro de 1991.
183. A EFICIÊNCIA DA INTERVENÇÃO DO ESTADO NA ECONOMIA - Fernando
de Holanda Barbosa - Dezembro de 1991
184. ASPECTOS ECONÔMICOS DAS EMPRESAS ESTATAIS NO BRASIL: TELECOMU-
NICAÇÕES, ELETRICIDADE - Fernando de Holanda Barbosa, Manuel
Jeremias Leite Caldas, Mario Jorge Pina e Hélio Lechuga Arteiro.
- Dezembro de 1991.
185. "THE EX-ANTE NON-OPTIMALITY OF THE DEMPSTER-SCHAFER UPDATING RULE FOR
AMBIGUOUS BELIEFS" - Sérgio Ribeiro da Costa Werlang e James Dow - feve-
reiro de 1992.

FUNDAÇÃO GETULIO VARGAS
BIBLIOTECA MARIO HENRIQUE SIMONSE